

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
OFFICE OF POSTSECONDARY EDUCATION
NATIONAL COMMITTEE ON FOREIGN MEDICAL
EDUCATION AND ACCREDITATION

OPEN SESSION

Monday, March 30, 2009

8:00 a.m.

The Madison - Loews Hotel
John Adams Room A & B
1177 15th Street, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20005

P A R T I C I P A N T S

COMMITTEE MEMBERS PRESENT:

J. LEE DOCKERY, M.D., Chairperson

RAYMOND F. CARON, M.D., Committee Member
MARTIN CRANE, M.D., Committee Member
JAMES A. HALLOCK, M.D., Committee Member
JOHN J. JUCAS, M.D., Committee Member
PAUL F. La PORTE, Student Committee Member
NORMAN I. MALDONADO, M.D., Committee Member
DAVID R. MUNOZ, M.D., Committee Member
KIRAN H. SHAH, M.D., Committee Member
DENNIS K. WENTZ, M.D., Committee Member

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION STAFF PRESENT:

MS. ROBIN GREATHOUSE, ASL Staff
MS. BARBARA HEMELT, FSA Foreign Schools Team
DR. JENNIFER HONG-SILWANY, ASL Staff
MR. WILLIAM JAMES, ASL Staff
MS. JOYCE JONES, ASL Staff
MS. MELISSA LEWIS, NCFMEA Executive Director
MR. STEPHEN PORCELLI, ASL Staff
DR. NANCY REGAN, ASL Director
MS. CATHY SHEFFIELD, ASL Staff
DR. RACHAEL SHULTZ, ASL Staff
MR. JAMES SNEED, ASL Staff
MS. SALLY WANNER, OGC Attorney

C O N T E N T S

Introductions and Opening Remarks Dr. Lee Dockery, Chairperson	7
Overview of Procedures for Review of Countries Ms. Melissa Lewis	
Review of Countries:	
<u>Cayman Islands</u>	
Type of Review: Redetermination	14
Department Staff: Ms. Joyce Jones	
Country Representatives: Dr. Anthony Peacock Dr. Ian Temperley	
<u>Saba</u>	
Type of Review: Report	42
Department Staff: Mr. James Sneed	
Country Representative: Dr. Anthony Peacock	
<u>Taiwan</u>	
Type of Review: Redetermination	51
Department Staff: Dr. Jennifer Hong-Silwany	
Country Representatives: Dr. Chi-Wan Lai Dr. Chyi-Her Lin	

C O N T E N T S

Grenada

Type of Review: Report 55

Committee Readers:

Dr. James Hallock
Dr. Norman Maldonado

Department Staff:

Mr. William James

Country Representatives

Dr. Thomas Monahan
Hon. Dessima Williams

Hungary

Type of Review: Redetermination 61

Committee Readers:

Dr. Martin Crane
Dr. Kiran Shah

Department Staff:

Dr. Rachael Shultz

Country Representatives:

Dr. Gabor L. Kovacs
Prof. Klara Mater
Mr. Balazs Erdei

Dominica

Type of Review: Redetermination 81

Committee Readers:

Dr. James Hallock
Dr. Dennis Wentz

Department Staff

Mr. Stephen Porcelli

Country Representatives:

Dr. Dorian C. Shillingford
Mr. Martin Michaelson

C O N T E N T S

Philippines

Type of Review: Report 93

Committee Readers:

Dr. Raymond Caron

Dr. Paul LaPorte

Department Staff

Mr. Chuck Mula

Country Representatives: None

Lunch - Training 96

Dr. Thomas Nasca

Dominican Republic

Type of Review: Review 149

Committee Readers:

Dr. Norman Maldonado

Dr. Kiran Shah

Department Staff

Mr. William James

Country Representatives

Mr. Emilio E. Huyke

Dr. Rosa Adelina Cespedes Garrido

India

Type of Review: Redetermination 156

Committee Readers

Dr. Raymond Caron

Dr. Martin Crane

Department Staff

Dr. Jennifer Hong-Silwany

Country Representatives

Dr. Ashwani Kumar

Dr. Vedprakash Mishra

C O N T E N T S

Pakistan

Type of Review: Redetermination 168

Committee Readers

Dr. David Munoz

Dr. Dennis Wentz

Department Staff

Mr. James Sneed

Country Representatives

Dr. Ahmad Nadeem Akbar

Prof. A.J. Khan

Prof. Umar Ali Khan

United Kingdom

Type of Review: Redetermination 173

Committee Readers:

Dr. John Jucas

Mr. Paul La Porte

Department Staff

Mr. William James

Country Representatives: None

Canada

Type of Review: Redetermination 182

Committee Readers:

Dr. John Jucas

Dr. Norman Maldonado

Department Staff:

Ms. Joyce Jones

Country Representatives: None

Adjourn

(Canada)

DR. DOCKERY: Thank you. Dr. Jones, we welcome you back again.

MS. JONES: I shan't go until Dr. Dockery returns. I think that your chairperson should be in the room.

DR. DOCKERY: Just for you all to know, I refused a photograph. Dr. Jones?

MS. JONES: Good afternoon, Dr. Dockery, and Committee members. I am pleased to present you with the summary of the e-petition for comparability of redetermination submitted by the Committee of Canadian Medical Schools, or CACMS. It's found behind Tab A.

Just a little background on CACMS shows that in February 1995 this committee originally determined that the CACMS used accreditation standards and processes in Canada that were comparable to the standards of accreditation applied to the M.D. programs in the United States. Similarly, the CACMS

reports that it is the Canadian counterpart to the Liaison Committee on Medical Education, or LCME, and uses the LCME standards and processes to accredit the Canadian medical schools.

Since the initial comparability determination in 1995, the CACMS has received continued redeterminations from this Committee. CACMS has also submitted reports requested by the Secretary that included, one, an overview of its accreditation activities, two, changes to the laws and regulations, three, changes to the standards, processes, and procedures, and four, a schedule of upcoming accreditation activities. After returning from a break in this committee's activities in 2007, the Department postponed the NCFMEA's review of Canada until this meeting to allow the CACMS to compile information requested by your executive director and Department staff.

The executive director specifically requested, among other things, that the CACMS

provide, one, written evidence of the accreditation relationship that exists between the LCME and CACMS, and two, explain what acknowledgment, recognition, or delegation of authority the CACMS had received from any governmental entities, either national and/or provincial, to serve as the insurer of quality medical education programs leading to the medical degree or its equivalent in Canada.

The CACMS Secretary, Dr. Nick Busing, spelled B-U-S-I-N-G, submitted a few documents and participated in a telephone conference with Department staff. The conference focused on identifying the entity responsible for approving opening and closing of medical schools in Canada. Dr. Busing explained that ministries of education in each province have the responsibility to open and close a medical school because no federal Department of Health or Department of Education exists in Canada. Additionally, two separate decision meetings on the Canadian medical schools occurred. The LCME makes an

accrediting decision on a Canadian medical program. Then the CACMS also makes an accrediting decision which may have different findings. Each group merges their respective findings and sends the combined findings to the school in one decision letter. The decision letter is signed by both the LCME and CACMS representatives.

The Department of Education's Office of Federal Student Aid provided the latest data on the federal student loan program disbursements under the Federal Family Education Loan program at 13 of the 17 accredited schools in Canada. For Fiscal Year 2007-2008, 1,391 students attended Canadian public universities that had medical schools and received nearly \$19 million in loans. The 2006 cohort rate, default rate shows that there were 703 individuals in repayment status with six individuals in default for a current default rate or the last known default rate at 0.9 percent.

The information provided by the

CACMS in its application for redetermination of comparability for accreditation of medical colleges is, of course, the subject of this analysis. First, the standards of accreditation used by Canada to accredit medical schools offering programs leading to the M.D. degree are the same standards of accreditation that are applied to review medical programs in the United States. Second, the CACMS has submitted written documentation demonstrating the implementation of its accreditation process.

Through Dr. Busing the CACMS, it has reported that medical schools have a relationship with the provincial governments related to the approval, the opening, and closing of a medical school, and the licensure of medical graduates who complete training at a CACMS accredited medical school. Yet, the CACMS has not reported on the relationship it has with Canada. Therefore, this committee may want to ask CACMS to provide evidence demonstrating that a relationship exists with

Canada and that the country accepts the agency as the organization it relies upon for ensuring that the accredited programs provide quality medical education.

No representatives from the country or CACMS are present today. However, I will respond to any questions that you have regarding the staff analysis. Thank you.

DR. DOCKERY: Thank you, Dr. Jones. Are there any questions from members of the committee before we go into executive session? Thank you. If we could ask our guests to please leave again.

(Whereupon, at 3:40 p.m., the proceedings went into Closed Session and the Open Sessions ended for the day.)